



TRANSLATION

Original: RUSSIAN

15 September 2008

REPORT ON TRAINING

DETECTION OF ILLEGAL WASTE TRANSPORTATION

*In the frame of the project
“Capacity Building for Combating Illegal Waste Transportation to Eastern Europe”*

Odessa, Ukraine 19-20 August 2008

A. ORGANIZATION OF THE MEETING

1. The first training in the frame of the project “Capacity Building for combating illegal waste transportation to Eastern Europe” was conducted in Odessa on 19-20 August 2008. The training was organized by the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) with the support of the Ministry of the Environment of Ukraine (MoE).
2. Objectives of the project are: 1) raising awareness of various authorities in charge on specifics of the Basel Convention and ways to improve security in regard with the transportation of hazardous waste and improving intersectoral cooperation, 2) increasing capacity for prevention and detection of the illegal waste transportation in Eastern Europe (Ukraine, Moldova, Belarus) which will also support implementation of the Basel Convention in the region. In the frame of the project it is planned to conduct an intersectoral workshop (organized in Kiev on 18 March 2008) and two trainings for officers responsible for controlling transboundary transportation of hazardous waste.
3. A project is a part of the Environment and Security Initiative (ENVSEC), which is a partnership of such organizations as OSCE, UNDP, UNECE, UNEP, NATO and REC.
4. An aim of the training is capacity building of officers responsible for controlling transboundary transportation of hazardous waste and, respectively, for detecting illegal waste shipment. An agenda of the training is attached in Annex 1.
5. 47 people took part in the training. Majority of them (39) were inspectors of the Department of ecological control and radioactive safety at the state border of the State Environmental Inspectorate of the MoE. The other participants were 2 experts of the Department of Environmental Safety of the MoE, a representative from the Customs Service of the Republic of Moldova, Ministry of Natural Resources and Protection of the Environment of the Republic of Belarus, the EU Border Assistance Mission to Moldova and Ukraine (EUBAM). List of participants can be found in Annex 2.
6. The principal instructor at the training was Head of Section “General Affairs of Waste Management, Focal Point to the Basel Convention” of the Federal Environment Agency of

Germany. Another instructor was Head of a Ukrainian NGO “Bureau of Environmental Investigations”.

B. PROCEEDINGS

7. Mr Moyseev, Acting Head of the Department of Environmental Safety of MoE welcomed the participants. Ms Kutonova presented the project idea, its objectives and expected results. Mrs Nazarchuk made an overview of the Ukrainian legislation on transboundary movement of waste, and Mr Yevseev – about role of the environmental inspectorate in detection and prevention of illegal waste shipment.
8. Mr Wuttke made review of the Basel Convention, and the EU Waste Shipment Regulation (Regulation No. 1013/2006), various systems of waste classification (German, the Basel Convention, EU, OECD), notification form and movement document.
9. Workshops / practical exercises (pictures are in Annex 4) were devoted to waste identification and falsifications / mistakes in notification forms and movement documents. The participants were divided into several groups for the first workshop and worked individually during the second one. Results were discussed upon completion of tasks.
10. Mr Skrylnikov, based on real cases, presented an overview of methods for illegal shipping of waste to Ukraine. E.g. the wastes were brought to Ukraine as the waste but the purpose of import was incorrect, or materials were different from those declared, or toxicity of materials was downscaled, etc. The wastes were also brought as raw materials for industry, or for trade, or the date was expired, or the waste which was classified as waste in a country of origin was legal article in a country of export (e.g. tyres, asbestos), etc.

C. EVALUATION AND CONCLUSIONS

11. The participants of the training filled in an evaluation form. The overall grade of the event was 4.3 – 4.5 points (using a 5-point scale, Annex 3). Workshops / practical exercises on waste identification and forms were rated as the most useful and interesting. The participants stressed usefulness of the training and a need to conduct similar events on a regular basis.
12. Taking into consideration suggestions of the participants to publish a compilation of case studies on illegal waste shipment to Ukraine, a project manager, the State Environmental Inspectorate and the NGO “Bureau of Environmental Investigations” will consider implementation of this idea.
13. A list of participants, ppt-presentations and materials of the training will be sent out to the training participants within a month after the event.
14. A project report will be prepared within a month after the event and will be sent out to the interested ministries / agencies.
15. The second training will be conducted in Kiev on 3-5 November. 50 people with equal representation from Belarus, Moldova and Ukraine will be invited to the training.



Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe

The Secretariat

**Co-ordinator of OSCE Economic and
Environmental Activities**

Project “Capacity Building for Combating Illegal Waste Transportation to Eastern Europe”

FIRST TRAINING

DETECTION OF ILLEGAL WASTE TRANSPORTATION

Hotel “Yunost”, Pionerskaya Str. 32, Odessa, Ukraine

18-20 August 2008

AGENDA

18 August 2008

Arrival of participants

15.00 – 17.00 Registration and introductory session for those who have already arrived (*French hall, 2nd floor*)

19 August 2008 (*Italian hall, 2nd floor*)

7.00 – 8.45 Breakfast (*restaurant of the 1st floor*)

8.30 – 9.00 Registration

9.00 - 9.15 Welcome and opening – *Victor Moyseenko (MoE of Ukraine)*

9.15 – 9.40 Introduction:

- ENVSEC Initiative
- the OSCE project “Capacity Building for Combating Illegal Waste Transportation to Eastern Europe”
- objectives of the training – *Tamara Kutonova (OSCE)*

9.40 – 10.05 Legal framework for waste transportation in Ukraine - *Olena Nazarchuk (MoE)*

10.05 – 10.25 Role of the environmental inspectorate in detection and prevention of waste trafficking - *Volodymyr Yevseev (State Environmental Inspectorate of Ukraine)*

10.25 – 11.00 Introduction - *Joachim Wuttke (Federal Environmental Agency, Germany)*

11.00 – 11.30 Coffee break

11.30 – 12.30 The Basel Convention - *Joachim Wuttke*

13.00 – 14.30 Lunch

14.30 – 16.00 Waste Definition and Classification - *Joachim Wuttke*

16.00 – 16.30	Coffee break
16.30 – 17.30	Workshop on Waste Classification - <i>Joachim Wuttke</i>
17.30 – 18.00	Evaluation of the Day 1 of the training
18.00	Dinner

20 August 2008 (*Italian hall, 2nd floor*)

7.00 – 8.45	Breakfast (<i>restaurant of the 1st floor</i>)
9.00 – 10.00	EU Waste Shipment Regulation including notification forms - <i>Joachim Wuttke</i>
10.00 – 11.00	Workshop on Forms
11.00 – 11.30	Coffee break
11.30 – 12.30	Illegal Shipment - <i>Joachim Wuttke</i>
12.30 – 13.00	Case studies
13.00 – 14.00	Lunch
14.00 – 15.00	Illegal Shipment - <i>Joachim Wuttke</i>
15.00 – 16.00	Illegal transportation of Hazardous Waste to Ukraine and Ways to Detect it – <i>Dmytro Skrylnikov</i> (<i>NGO “Bureau of Environmental Investigations”</i>)
16.00 – 16.30	Exchange of experience
16.30 – 17.30	Evaluation of the Day 2 and the training Recommendations for November training Closure of the training
18.00	Dinner Departure of the participants

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

TRAINING

*In the frame of the project
“Capacity Building for Combating Illegal Waste Transportation to Eastern Europe”*

Odessa, Ukraine 19-20 August 2008

#	Last name / Name	Organization and position	Contact information
Responsible authorities			
1.	Buda Ferenc	Head of Department of ecological control and radioactive safety at the state border of the State Environmental Inspectorate of the MoE (farther: Ecoinspectorate), border control unit (BCU) Luzhanka, Zakarpatyie oblast	T.: (050) 541 82 02 Fax: (031) 412 33 50
2.	Chikomasov Vladimir	Head of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Bachevsk, Sumy oblast	T.: (05444) 725 15, (067) 542 78 74, (099) 047 10 02 Fax: (05444) 725 15
3.	Derboglav Vladimir	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate for the Black Sea, sea trade port (STP) Skadovsk, Odessa	T.: (048) 787 72 73
4.	Gramatyk Vladimir	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Highway Kuchurgany, Odessa	T.: (048) 728 38 61, (067) 924 89 78
5.	Halus Vladimir	Head of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Tisza, Zakarpatyie oblast	T.: (03122) 228 52 Fax: (03122) 228 82
6.	Jovic Alexander	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Belgorod-Dnestrovskiy	T.: (4849) 382 99, (066) 133 22 583
7.	Karnaukhov Oleg	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Railway station Kuchurgany, Odessa oblast	T.: (067) 253 00 36
8.	Kaydashov Oleg	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Kherson STP	T.: (050) 518 18 045
9.	Khomenko Oleg	Head of the Ecoinspectorate in Zaporozhye oblast	T.: (050) 486 06 40 Fax: (0612) 200 316
10.	Koval Svetlana	Ecoinspectorate for the Black Sea, Odessa	T.: (048) 787 72 73
11.	Koval Yulia	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate for the Black Sea, STP Ilychevsk, Odessa	T.: (066) 792 35 47
12.	Kovalchuk Vladimir	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Grenyach and Novgorod-Severskiy, Chernigov oblast	T.: (04658) 312 09, (066) 386 14 67 Fax: (04658) 312 09 Email: kovalchuk.71@mail.ru
13.	Korniychuk Petr	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Railway Station Odessa oblast	T.: (04867) 270 00
14.	Kotyash Zahar	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Gorodishche, Rovno oblast	T.: (03658) 551 28
15.	Krivosos Nickolai	Ecoinspectorate for the Black Sea, Odessa	T.: (063) 575 05 70 Fax: (048) 715 07 09
16.	Kudrik Sergei	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Senkovka and Railway station Shchors, Chernigov oblast	T.: (04645) 215 49, (097) 544 118
17.	Litvinyuk Igor	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate in Odessa oblast	T.: (067) 305 3019
18.	Moyseeno Victor	Acting Head of Department of Environmental Safety, MoE, Kiev	T.: (044) 206 31 16 Email: v.moyseenko@menr.gov.ua

#	Last name / Name	Organization and position	Contact information
19.	Nazarchuk Elena	Head of Unit on Management of Waste and other Hazardous Substances, Department of Environmental Security, MoE, Kiev	T.: (044) 206 31 65 Email: nazarchuk@menr.gov.ua
20.	Olexin Ivan	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate in Ivano-Frankovsk oblast	T.: (0342) 509 049, (050) 373 27 69 Fax: (0342) 509 049
21.	Panchenko Yuriy	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Korosten, Zhitomir oblast	T.: (04142) 921 97
22.	Pogorilyy Alexander	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Izmail STP, Odessa oblast	T.: (067) 770 07 22 Fax: (04841) 243 29
23.	Polyakov Fyodor	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Ust-Dunaysk STP, Odessa oblast	T.: (097) 308 34 21 T./Fax: (04843) 312 73
24.	Prus Vladimir	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Highway Mayaki, Odessa oblast	T.: (097) 617 71 52
25.	Radionov Vladimir	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate in Odessa oblast	T.: (048) 799 90 30
26.	Ratushnyak Ivan	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Rosashany and Lana	T.: (050) 598 68 08 Fax: (0372) 252 63 36
27.	Robov Vyacheslav	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Reni STP, Odessa oblast	T./Fax : (04840) 430 28 Email: rvu74@rambler.ru
28.	Romanovskiy Alexander	Head of the Ecoinspectorate in Lugansk oblast	T.: (0642) 935 446, (050) 970 62 77 Fax: (0642) 93 54 46
29.	Rudyy Boris	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate for the Black Sea at BCU Nikolayev STP, Odessa oblast	T.: (095) 151 19 19
30.	Ryabchinskiy Alexander	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Ilychevsk, Odessa oblast	T.: (067) 955 11 82
31.	Samostoy Olga	Head of the Ecoinspectorate in Sumy oblast	T.: (067) 542 78 81 Fax: (0542) 629 074
32.	Skalatskiy Oleg	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Highway Platonovo, Odessa oblast	T.: (04861) 219 07, (04861) 211 96
33.	Shepel Andrey	Ecoinspectorate at BCU Ilychevsk STP, Odessa oblast	T.: (06823) 983 39 Fax: (04871) 707 10 Email: shepel_andrey@ukr.net
34.	Shpakovskiy Sergey	Ecoinspectorate for the Black Sea, Odessa oblast	T.: (098) 215 21 00 Fax: (048) 728 38 61
35.	Vakalyuk Victor	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Highway Yagodin, Volyn oblast	T.: (067) 750 91 83
36.	Velichko Yuriy	Head of the Ecoinspectorate in Kharkov oblast	T.: (057) 705 06 96, (050) 574 95 22
37.	Velinov Georgiy	Lead expert of the Ecoinspectorate for the Black Sea, Odessa	T.: (048) 729 41 54, (067) 775 34 21 Fax: (048) 729 32 94
38.	Yevseev Vladimir	Head of the Department of ecological control and radioactive safety at the state border of the State Environmental Inspectorate of MoE, Kiev	T./Fax: (044) 521 20 33
39.	Zarubin Anatoliy	Head of the Ecoinspectorate in Vinnitsa oblast	T.: (0432) 513 149, (067) 736 70 65 T./Fax: (0432) 466 758
40.	Zhukovskiy Vitaliy	Head of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Pulemets, Volyn oblast	T.: (033) 552 09 63 Fax: (033) 582 95 03
41.	Zolotko Alexander	Head of the Ecoinspectorate at BCU Novoazovsk	T.: (062) 340 00 46
Representatives of Belarus and Moldova			
42.	Alexei Maxim	Senior inspector of Department of Violations at Customs, Custom Service of Republic of Moldova, Chisinau	T.: +373 69 286 286 Mob.: +373 22 574 168 Email: maxalexei@rambler.ru
43.	Sazonova Olga	Lead expert of the Special Inspection of the State Control on Waste management, Ministry of Natural Resources and Protection of the Environment of the Republic of Belarus, Minsk	T.: +375 17 200 6121 Email: waste@minpriroda.by , saz_05@mail.ru

#	Last name / Name	Organization and position	Contact information
Instructors			
44.	Skrylnikov Dmitry	Head of an NGO "Bureau of Environmental Investigations", Lviv	T.: (032) 220 11 40 Email: dskrylnikov@mail.lviv.ua
45.	Wuttke Joachim	Head of Section "General Affairs of Waste Management, Focal Point to the Basel Convention" of the Federal Environment Agency of Germany, Berlin	T./Fax: +49 (0) 30 312 43 66 Email: joachim.wuttke@uba.de
Facilitators and observers			
46.	Kutonova Tamara	National Officer on the Environment and Security Initiative at OSCE Project Coordinator in Ukraine / OSCE Office of Coordinator of Economic and Environmental Activities, Kiev	T.: (044) 492 03 82, (067) 725 40 12 Fax: (044) 492 03 83 Email: tamara.kutonova@osce.org
47.	Ostasz Agnieszka	EUBAM, Odessa	T./Fax: (482) 365 274, (050) 492 57 82 Email: agnieszka.ostasz@eubam.org

EVALUATION OF THE TRAINING

“Detection of Illegal Hazardous Waste Shipping”

Odessa 19-20 August 2008

5 - excellent, 4 – good, 3 – satisfactory, 2 - bad, 1 – very bad

DAY 1

Presentation “The Basel Convention”

3 - ii

4 - iiiiiiiiiiiiii

5 - iiiiii

- well presented
- clear
- less focus on EU should be done.

Presentation “Waste Definition and Classification”

3 - iiiii

4 - iiiiiiiiiiiiii

5 - iiiiii

- all is clear
- classifications of EU and Basel are not clear enough
- not clear enough
- a complicated scheme
- not all issues were explained
- Ukrainian reality is not taken into account
- hard to comprehend but very useful
- little time is devoted.

Workshop on Waste Classification

3 – iii

4 - iiiiii

5 - iiiiiiiiiiiiii

- more time should be allocated - iiiiii
- very interesting - ii
- translation is to be better
- more examples.

Overall impression of the Day 1, comments and suggestions

4 - iiiiiiiiiiiiii

5 - iiiiiiiiii

- excellent
- more practical exercises are needed
- translation was not always exact
- informative
- there should be more case studies.

DAY 2

Presentation “EU Waste Shipment Regulation including notification forms”

3 - iii

4 - iiiiiiiiiii

5 - iiiiii

- unlikely this can be used at every-day activities of an inspector
- more practical examples are needed
- more pieces of advice are needed
- very useful
- more time for practice should be allocated
- more time should be devoted to explanation of falsifications in forms.

Presentation “Illegal Shipment”

3 - i

4 - iiiiiiiiiii

5- iiiiii

- not enough examples on Ukraine
- can be shorter (it is not for inspectors but for MoE).

Illegal transportation of Hazardous Waste to Ukraine and Ways to Detect it (*Dmytro Skrylnikov*)

4 - iiiiiiiiiii

5 - iiiiii

- clear - ii
- to issue a brochure with case studies when illegal shipping was detected - ii
- lots of concrete examples, very useful
- very good
- legally competently
- serious and interesting work of the organization
- periodical methodical publication should be issued.

OVERALL EVALUATION

Methods used in the training

3 - i

4 - iiiiiiiiiii

5 - iiiiii

- demonstrations are good
- interesting material and presentations, good practical exercises
- practical exercises are interesting.

Was there enough time to discuss issues which are of interest for you?

- Enough - iiiiiiiiiiiii
- Not enough - iii
- Even a week cannot be enough
- More time should be allocated for questions
- More time for practice should be allocated.

What do you consider the most useful in the training?

- practical tasks - iiiiiiiiiiiii
- materials
- exchange of experience between different countries
- exchange of experience with other inspectors
- good preparation to the training by Joachim

- raising professionalism
- presentations by Joachim.

What would you not include to the training?

- regulation of the EC (bad translation) - ii
- all is needed – ii
- the programme was well thought
- approach of the lector and organizers is very good.

Overall evaluation of usefulness of the training from the point of Your every-day responsibilities

3 - iii

4 - iiiiii

5 - iiiiii

- such trainings should be organized more often
- practical exercises are good
- very useful, broadened our knowledge
- there should be more practical tasks
- there should be more practical pieces of advice
- not much can be used
- regular meetings with representatives of the OSCE and Basel Convention are needed
- little connection to Ukrainian legislation and local conditions of work at control points
- I am very glad, I will apply the info for every-day work
- I will do similar training for my colleagues.

Logistics (food, rooms, halls, agenda) and materials

2 - ii

3 - i

4 - iiiiii

5 - iiiii

- high level - ii
- materials in e-form should be distributed
- the training can be longer.

Overall impression, comments and suggestions

3 - i

4 - iiiiiiiiii

5 - iiiii

- “field trip” to the control points should be organised - iiiiii
- the training should be organized annually - iii
- presentations should be distributed (electronically or as hard copies) - iii
- lots of useful information
- fruitful, lots of new information
- positive
- there should be less overview but more practice
- to involve NGOs
- there should be more practical exercises and legislation of Ukraine
- more time is needed
- the training should be longer
- include a quiz
- to invite customs and border authorities to the training
- lots of information, perhaps the training should be longer
- thanks!
- very useful – good luck!

PICTURES FROM THE TRAINING



Volodymyr Yevseev speaks about role of the environmental inspectorate in detection of illegal hazardous waste shipment



Dr Wuttke before a lecture on transboundary waste transportation



Workshop on waste identification



Workshop on waste identification



Workshop on forms



Dmytro Skrylnikov makes an overview of cases of illegal waste shipment to Ukraine